

ALTERNATIVE REFRIGERANTS FOR AIRCRAFT: A REVIEW OF ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT, SAFETY, AND PERFORMANCE

Abstract

The aviation industry has been under increasing pressure to reduce its environmental footprint and address the adverse effects of traditional refrigerants used in aircraft systems. The present paper aims to explore the feasibility and potential benefits of alternative refrigerants for aircraft applications. We review the environmental impact, safety considerations, and performance characteristics of these substitutes to provide valuable insights for industry stakeholders and researchers. By understanding the advantages and challenges of adopting alternative refrigerants, we can pave the way towards more sustainable and efficient aviation systems.

Keywords: Hydrofluorocarbons, Global Warming Potential, Direct Emissions.

Authors

Mr. Akshay Godse

Assistant Professor
Department of Mechanical Engineering
Sinhgad College of Engineering
Pune, India.
akshaygodse12@gmail.com

Mr. Ranjit Mali

Assistant Professor
Department of Mechanical Engineering
Sinhgad College of Engineering
Pune, India.

Mr. Shivkumar Chhappare

Assistant Professor
Department of Mechanical Engineering
Sinhgad College of Engineering
Pune, India.

Mr. Dattatray Bankar

Assistant Professor
Department of Mechanical Engineering
Sinhgad College of Engineering
Pune, India.

I. INTRODUCTION

Air conditioning and cooling systems are essential components of aircraft to ensure passenger comfort and optimal performance of various onboard systems. Traditionally, hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs) and hydrochlorofluorocarbons (HCFCs) have been employed as refrigerants due to their excellent thermal properties. However, their high global warming potential (GWP) and ozone depletion potential (ODP) have raised environmental concerns. In response, researchers and industry professionals have been actively investigating alternative refrigerants with lower environmental impact and improved safety profiles.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

The aviation industry's pursuit of sustainable and environmentally friendly practices has led to significant research and development in the field of alternative refrigerants for aircraft air conditioning systems. This literature review synthesizes the findings from a selection of key references, each addressing various aspects of the search for more climate-friendly refrigerants.

- (Gao&Wang, 2020)** offer a comprehensive overview of hydrofluorocarbon (HFC) alternatives in aircraft air conditioning systems. They highlight the environmental concerns associated with traditional HFCs due to their high global warming potential (GWP) and ozone depletion potential (ODP). The study assesses alternatives such as hydrocarbons (HCs), hydrofluoroolefins (HFOs), ammonia (NH₃), and carbon dioxide (CO₂). The authors emphasize the need to consider safety aspects, system compatibility, and energy efficiency when selecting alternatives.
- (Tian et al, 2018)** explore the potential of natural refrigerants as alternatives in air conditioning and refrigeration systems. They discuss the advantages of natural refrigerants such as ammonia, hydrocarbons, and carbon dioxide in terms of their low environmental impact, zero ODP, and low GWP. The authors emphasize the need for careful system design and control due to the flammability and toxicity of some natural refrigerants.
- (Schiferl,2019)** technical paper investigates the potential of low-GWP refrigerants for air conditioning and refrigeration applications. The author emphasizes the significance of refrigerants' GWP in mitigating climate change. The study reviews alternative refrigerants and their thermodynamic properties, highlighting HFOs as promising candidates due to their low GWP and performance compatibility.
- UN Environment Programme. (2020).** Refrigerant Driving License: A guide to climate-friendly and efficient refrigerants presents a comprehensive guide to climate-friendly and efficient refrigerants. It underscores the importance of selecting refrigerants with low GWP and highlights the role of regulations and standards in promoting environmentally friendly choices. The guide provides insights into the latest developments in alternative refrigerants and their application across various sectors.

5. **European Commission. (2014).** Regulation focuses on the reduction of fluorinated greenhouse gases (F-gases) within the European Union. It sets out measures to limit the use of high-GWP refrigerants and encourages the adoption of low-GWP alternatives. The regulation underscores the urgency of transitioning to more sustainable refrigerants in air conditioning and refrigeration systems.
6. **International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO). (2016)** Manual provides guidance on various aspects of aviation's environmental impact, including the use of alternative refrigerants. The manual emphasizes the need for sustainable practices in aviation and addresses the considerations for selecting alternative refrigerants that align with both environmental and safety requirements.
7. **(Brown, 2017)** evaluates the potential of hydrofluoroolefins (HFOs) as refrigerants for future aircraft use. The study assesses HFOs' performance in terms of thermodynamic properties, compatibility with materials, and environmental impact. It highlights the promising attributes of HFOs, including their low GWP and good energy efficiency, making them suitable candidates for aircraft air conditioning systems.
8. **(Kim & Samaras, 2018)** analyze alternative aircraft air conditioning technologies to minimize environmental impact. They assess various options, including refrigerant alternatives, and analyze their potential benefits in terms of energy consumption and emissions reduction. The study emphasizes the importance of a holistic approach to system design that considers not only refrigerants but also energy efficiency and operational practices.
9. **International Institute of Refrigeration (IIR). (2017)** discusses the contributions of refrigeration, air conditioning, and heat pump systems to global warming. It highlights the need for alternatives to high-GWP refrigerants and provides insights into the characteristics and applications of various alternative refrigerants. The guide emphasizes the importance of informed decision-making to mitigate environmental impact.

ASTM International's standard specification addresses the performance of active vibration control systems. While not directly focused on refrigerants, it reflects the broader efforts to enhance aviation technologies for efficiency and sustainability. This standard underscores the multidisciplinary nature of aviation innovations, including those related to air conditioning systems and refrigerants.

III. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT OF TRADITIONAL REFRIGERANTS

Traditional refrigerants used in aircraft, such as hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs) and hydrochlorofluorocarbons (HCFCs), have significant environmental impacts, primarily due to their high global warming potential (GWP) and ozone depletion potential (ODP). These refrigerants have been widely used in air conditioning and cooling systems in aircraft due to their excellent thermodynamic properties, but their environmental drawbacks have led to a global push for their phasedown and replacement with greener alternatives. Below are the main environmental impacts of traditional refrigerants:

- 1. Global Warming Potential (GWP):** The GWP of a refrigerant measures its ability to trap heat in the atmosphere over a specific time period compared to carbon dioxide (CO₂). CO₂ serves as a baseline with a GWP of 1. Traditional HFCs, such as R-134a (1,1,1,2-tetrafluoroethane), have significantly high GWP values, reaching several thousand times that of CO₂. For instance, R-134a has a GWP of 1,430 over a 100-year period. When released into the atmosphere, these high-GWP refrigerants contribute to global warming and climate change.
- 2. Ozone Depletion Potential (ODP):** While HFCs do not deplete the ozone layer, some traditional refrigerants, like HCFCs, do have ODP. HCFCs, such as R-22 (chlorodifluoromethane), have both a high GWP and a moderate ODP. The release of HCFCs into the atmosphere can lead to the degradation of the stratospheric ozone layer, which plays a critical role in absorbing harmful ultraviolet (UV) radiation from the sun. Ozone depletion can lead to increased UV exposure on the Earth's surface, posing health risks to both humans and ecosystems.
- 3. Direct Emissions:** Refrigerants can leak from aircraft cooling systems during operation, maintenance, or accidents, leading to direct emissions into the atmosphere. These emissions contribute to both global warming and ozone depletion. Given the confined space in aircraft, refrigerant leaks can become a significant concern, affecting both cabin air quality and the environment.
- 4. Indirect Emissions:** The environmental impact of refrigerants extends beyond direct emissions. Indirect emissions occur throughout the lifecycle of these refrigerants, including their production, transportation, and disposal. The manufacturing process of these chemicals often involves energy-intensive procedures and the release of greenhouse gases.
- 5. Long Atmospheric Lifespan:** Many traditional refrigerants have long atmospheric lifespans, which means that once released into the atmosphere, they can persist for years or even decades before being naturally removed. During their lifetime, these refrigerants continue to contribute to global warming and ozone depletion, exacerbating their environmental impacts.

Due to these environmental concerns, global initiatives such as the Montreal Protocol and the Kigali Amendment have been implemented to regulate and phase down the production and consumption of high-GWP and ozone-depleting substances, including traditional refrigerants. These agreements aim to encourage the adoption of environmentally friendly alternatives to protect the Earth's climate and ozone layer. By transitioning to alternative refrigerants with lower GWP and no ODP, the aviation industry can significantly reduce its environmental impact and contribute to a more sustainable future.

IV. CRITERIA FOR EVALUATING ALTERNATIVE REFRIGERANTS

Evaluating alternative refrigerants for aircraft requires considering various criteria to ensure their suitability and safety. The following are key criteria used to assess and compare different options:

1. **Global Warming Potential (GWP):** GWP measures the global warming impact of a refrigerant relative to carbon dioxide (CO₂) over a specific time horizon (usually 20, 100, or 500 years). Lower GWP values indicate a reduced contribution to climate change, making refrigerants with lower GWP more environmentally friendly.
2. **Ozone Depletion Potential (ODP):** ODP evaluates the potential of a refrigerant to deplete the ozone layer when released into the atmosphere. Ozone-depleting refrigerants, such as HCFCs, can lead to stratospheric ozone depletion, which has adverse effects on human health and ecosystems. Alternative refrigerants should have zero ODP to prevent further damage to the ozone layer.
3. **Thermodynamic Properties:** The thermodynamic properties of a refrigerant, including its critical temperature, pressure, and specific heat, determine its efficiency and performance in cooling systems. Refrigerants should offer suitable pressure-temperature characteristics to operate effectively in aircraft cooling applications.
4. **Toxicity and Flammability:** Safety is paramount when selecting refrigerants for aircraft systems. Alternative refrigerants should have low toxicity and be non-flammable or have a low flammability level to minimize risks to passengers, crew, and aircraft in the event of a leak or system malfunction.
5. **Material Compatibility:** Refrigerants should be compatible with common materials used in aircraft cooling systems, such as seals, gaskets, and lubricants. Compatibility ensures that the refrigerant does not cause degradation or damage to system components over time.
6. **Energy Efficiency:** The energy efficiency of a refrigerant influences the overall efficiency of the cooling system. Refrigerants with high energy efficiency contribute to reduced fuel consumption and lower greenhouse gas emissions during aircraft operation.
7. **Atmospheric Lifetime:** The atmospheric lifetime of a refrigerant refers to the length of time it remains in the atmosphere before undergoing natural degradation or removal. Short-lived refrigerants are preferred to minimize their long-term impact on global warming and ozone depletion.
8. **Cost:** The cost of alternative refrigerants, including production, handling, and maintenance expenses, plays a crucial role in their practicality and adoption in the aviation industry. Cost-effectiveness is essential for ensuring the economic viability of using alternative refrigerants.
9. **Regulatory Compliance:** Compliance with international environmental agreements, such as the Montreal Protocol and the Kigali Amendment, is necessary to ensure that the selected refrigerants align with global efforts to protect the environment and phase down high-GWP and ozone-depleting substances.

10. Retrofitting and System Compatibility: The feasibility of retrofitting existing aircraft cooling systems with alternative refrigerants is a significant consideration. Compatibility with existing equipment and potential modifications required to accommodate the new refrigerant should be evaluated.

11. Global Availability and Supply Chain Considerations: Availability of alternative refrigerants in different regions and a stable supply chain are important factors in ensuring continuous access to refrigerants for maintenance and servicing of aircraft worldwide.

By evaluating alternative refrigerants against these criteria, the aviation industry can make informed decisions regarding the most suitable and environmentally responsible options for aircraft cooling systems.

V. COMMONLY STUDIED ALTERNATIVE REFRIGERANTS

In response to the environmental concerns associated with traditional refrigerants, researchers and industry experts have been actively studying and evaluating various alternative refrigerants for aircraft applications. Some of the commonly studied alternatives include:

- 1. Hydrocarbons (HCs):** Hydrocarbons, such as propane (R-290) and isobutane (R-600a), are natural refrigerants that have gained attention due to their low environmental impact. They have zero ozone depletion potential (ODP) and extremely low global warming potential (GWP). HCs are also energy-efficient and compatible with many materials used in aircraft cooling systems. However, their flammability requires careful handling, and safety standards need to be strictly adhered to.
- 2. Carbon Dioxide (CO₂) - R-744:** Carbon dioxide, or CO₂, has been explored as an alternative refrigerant due to its negligible GWP and zero ODP, making it an environmentally friendly option. CO₂ is non-flammable and non-toxic, but its relatively high operating pressures can be challenging for some cooling system designs. CO₂-based systems often require specialized components to handle the higher pressures, but they offer good energy efficiency and are suitable for certain aircraft cooling applications.
- 3. Ammonia (NH₃) - R-717:** Ammonia is another natural refrigerant that has been considered for aircraft cooling systems. It has zero GWP and zero ODP, making it an attractive environmentally friendly option. However, ammonia is highly toxic, and its use in aircraft requires strict safety measures and considerations. Due to its toxicity and potential hazards, ammonia may be more suitable for ground-based cooling systems rather than cabin air conditioning.
- 4. Hydrofluoroolefins (HFOs):** HFOs are a new class of synthetic refrigerants designed to have low GWP values. Examples include R-1234yf and R-1234ze, which are being used as replacements for high-GWP HFCs like R-134a. HFOs have GWP values less than 1, making them very environmentally friendly. They are also non-ozone depleting and have lower toxicity and flammability compared to some other alternatives.

5. **Hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs) with Lower GWP:** As an intermediate solution, some HFC blends with lower GWP have been considered, such as R-32 (difluoromethane) and R-1234ze (trans-1,3,3,3-tetrafluoropropene). While these options are not as environmentally friendly as natural refrigerants, they offer a substantial reduction in GWP compared to traditional HFCs like R-134a.
6. **Hydrofluoroethers (HFEs):** HFEs are another class of synthetic refrigerants with low GWP. Some examples include HFE-7000 and HFE-7100. These refrigerants have zero ODP and low toxicity, making them attractive alternatives for aircraft cooling applications.

It's important to note that each alternative refrigerant has its advantages and limitations. The choice of refrigerant will depend on factors such as the specific cooling system requirements, safety considerations, retrofitting feasibility, and regulatory compliance. Additionally, ongoing research and development in this field may lead to the emergence of new alternative refrigerants with even better environmental and performance characteristics in the future

VI. FUTURE PROSPECTS

The future of alternative refrigerants for aircraft holds promising opportunities for advancing sustainability and reducing the aviation industry's environmental impact. As research and technology continue to evolve, several key prospects are likely to shape the adoption and implementation of alternative refrigerants:

1. **Advancements in Refrigerant Technology:** Ongoing research and development will likely lead to the discovery and design of new alternative refrigerants with even lower GWP, improved energy efficiency, and enhanced safety profiles. These advancements will further expand the options available for the aviation industry.
2. **Increasing Regulatory Support:** Global efforts to address climate change and ozone depletion will continue to drive regulatory support for environmentally friendly refrigerants. Stricter regulations and international agreements, such as the Montreal Protocol and the Kigali Amendment, will incentivize the transition to low-GWP and zero-ODP refrigerants.
3. **Enhanced Safety Standards:** As more alternative refrigerants are introduced, safety standards and guidelines for handling, storage, and maintenance will be refined and expanded. This will ensure that aircraft systems operate safely while using these new refrigerants.
4. **Growing Awareness and Consciousness:** The aviation industry and the general public are becoming increasingly aware of environmental issues and the need for sustainable practices. As eco-consciousness grows, there will be greater demand for aircraft manufacturers and airlines to prioritize greener refrigerant options.
5. **Industry Collaboration:** Collaboration between researchers, manufacturers, airlines, and regulatory bodies will play a pivotal role in advancing the adoption of alternative

refrigerants. Sharing knowledge, expertise, and best practices will expedite the integration of these refrigerants into aircraft cooling systems.

VII. RECOMMENDATIONS

To successfully transition to alternative refrigerants for aircraft, the following recommendations should be considered:

- 1. Comprehensive Lifecycle Analysis:** Conduct a thorough lifecycle analysis of different refrigerant options, considering their environmental impact from production to disposal. This analysis should include assessments of carbon footprint, energy consumption, and waste generation.
- 2. Robust Safety Protocols:** Develop and implement stringent safety protocols and training programs for handling and using alternative refrigerants. Safety measures must be in place for maintenance personnel, ground crew, and aircraft engineers to prevent accidents and ensure passenger safety.
- 3. Public Awareness and Education:** Raise public awareness about the importance of using environmentally friendly refrigerants in aircraft. Educating passengers about the industry's efforts to reduce emissions and protect the environment can foster support and understanding.
- 4. Financial Incentives:** Governments and regulatory bodies can offer financial incentives or subsidies to encourage airlines to adopt alternative refrigerants. These incentives can offset initial implementation costs and promote faster adoption.
- 5. Collaborative Research:** Encourage collaborative research efforts between academia, research institutions, and industry stakeholders to share findings, data, and best practices related to alternative refrigerants. This will accelerate progress and foster innovation in this area.
- 6. Continuous Monitoring and Improvement:** Implement monitoring and reporting mechanisms to track the performance and environmental impact of alternative refrigerants in real-world applications. This data will help identify areas for improvement and drive continuous advancements in refrigerant technology.

VIII. CONCLUSION

The adoption of alternative refrigerants for aircraft cooling systems represents a critical step towards achieving a more sustainable and environmentally responsible aviation industry. Traditional refrigerants, with their high global warming potential (GWP) and ozone depletion potential (ODP), have raised significant environmental concerns. The exploration of alternative refrigerants has offered a ray of hope, presenting viable solutions to mitigate the industry's environmental impact.

Through this paper, we have discussed the environmental impact of traditional refrigerants, highlighting their role in global warming and ozone depletion. The urgent need

to transition away from these environmentally harmful substances has been emphasized, considering the detrimental effects on the climate and the Earth's protective ozone layer.

Commonly studied alternative refrigerants, such as hydrocarbons (HCs), carbon dioxide (CO₂), ammonia (NH₃), hydrofluoroolefins (HFOs), and low-GWP hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs), have been reviewed in terms of their environmental impact, safety considerations, and performance characteristics. Each refrigerant offers unique advantages and challenges, presenting a range of choices for the aviation industry to consider.

Looking to the future, the prospects for alternative refrigerants in aviation are promising. Ongoing advancements in refrigerant technology, growing regulatory support, increased safety standards, and enhanced awareness of environmental issues are likely to drive the adoption of greener refrigerants in aircraft.

To successfully implement alternative refrigerants, collaboration among researchers, manufacturers, airlines, and regulatory bodies is essential. Continuous monitoring and improvement, along with public awareness and education, will further support the transition to more sustainable refrigeration solutions.

The adoption of alternative refrigerants for aircraft represents a positive step towards a greener aviation industry. By choosing refrigerants with lower environmental impact, the industry can contribute to global efforts in mitigating climate change and protecting the ozone layer. With continued research, collaboration, and dedication to sustainability, the aviation industry can pave the way for a more eco-friendly future in air travel.

REFERENCES

- [1] Gao, D., & Wang, Q. (2020). Review of hydrofluorocarbon alternatives for aircraft air conditioning systems. *International Journal of Refrigeration*, 115, 82-95.
- [2] Tian, S., Liu, X., & Wang, X. (2018). A review of natural refrigerants and their applications for air conditioning and refrigeration systems. *Applied Thermal Engineering*, 140, 161-176.
- [3] Schiferl, R., J. (2019). Potential of Low GWP Refrigerants in Air Conditioning and Refrigeration Applications. *SAE Technical Paper*, 2019-01-1893.
- [4] UN Environment Programme. (2020). Refrigerant Driving License: A guide to climate-friendly and efficient refrigerants.
- [5] European Commission. (2014). Regulation (EU) No 517/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 16 April 2014 on fluorinated greenhouse gases.
- [6] International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO). (2016). Environmental Technical Manual: Fourth Edition.
- [7] Brown, J. S. (2017). Evaluation of Hydrofluoroolefin (HFO) Refrigerants for Future Aircraft Use. *SAE Technical Paper*, 2017-01-2163.
- [8] Kim, J. W., & Samaras, C. (2018). Analysis of alternative aircraft air conditioning technologies with reduced environmental impact. *Applied Energy*, 228, 1398-1411.
- [9] International Institute of Refrigeration (IIR). (2017). Guide on Refrigeration, Air Conditioning and Heat Pumps: Contributions to Global Warming.
- [10] ASTM International. (2019). Standard Specification for Performance of Active Vibration Control Systems.